



GLOBAL ROUNDTABLE FOR SUSTAINABLE BEEF

National Roundtables Minutes March 27, 2023

GRSB Members Present:

Ryan Beierbach (CCA), Edward Moreno (MBCS), Alfred Fast, Hugo Sanchez (MPCS), German Serrano (MGSC), Luiza Bruscato (GTPS), Leopoldo Estol (MACS), Sam Werth (USRSB), Matt Cleveland (ABS), Kevin Kester (Bear Valley Ranch), Sebastian Olaso Aguirre (Sol Dorado); Alfonso Valderrama Martinez (PNUD); Alba Lucia Suarez Quiceno, Claudia Patricia Roldan Calle (ASOBUFALOS); Pedro Antonio Valderrama Salazar (GSIC); Walter Ivan Gutierrez Sanchez, Sandra Marcela Restrepo Montoya (NaturaCert); Maria Vianaa Borda Calvache (IICA); Andres Felipe Pererz Rojo (FNSDL); Andrea Ocampo (Grupo Exito); Servelio Hernandez (Calfsolution S.A.); Maria Cristina Saenz (Limor); Maria Camila Yepes, Camila Cammaert (WWF Colombia); Simon Callejas Ochoa (Confama); Rendon Eduardo (WWF Mexico); America Melo (TNC); Andres Horacio Carvajal Pardo; Olga Lucia Caro Jacome (Expertise France); Alejandro Estanislao Hurtado Fernandez, Victor Hugo Magallanes Landa, Edward Moreno Coimbra (Boliva Roundtable); Percy Summers, Juan Carlos Lara (Conservation Int'l) Juan Camilo Escalante (ABS Colombia); Fernanda Reis Cordeiro, Alexander Bernal Leon (Minerva Foods); Marco Enciso (Midagri); Andrea Paola Fernandez Lavado, Clarita Bustamante (Colombia Roundtable); Cristina Morales (Paraguay Roundtable); Jorge Saenz (Proforest); (Ian McConnel, Bob Lowe, Executive Committee). *Via Zoom:* Louisa Icke (NZRSB), Monica Hadarits (CRSB), Anne Gillespie (Textile Exchange), Roz Davis (ERBS).

GRSB Staff Present: Ruaraidh Petre, Josefina Eisele, Scott Stuart, Katie Ambrose

Regenerative Ag

There was discussion on regenerative agriculture as applicable in the various regions. McConnel stated GRSB's Global Goals are aligned with Regenerative Agriculture although there are key differences with some practitioners. In order to establish a position, we must be clear on what it is, and is not. Discussion consensus was that Regenerative is specific to improving soil health, and improving soil health is an aspect of Sustainability which is all-encompassing.

Petre shared the Natural Resources section of GRSB's Principles & Criteria which speaks to environmental stewardship practices with adaptive management including: improving soil quality and bio diversity, conserving health of eco systems which all aligns with the Regenerative conversation.

ACTION:

It was agreed that GRSB membership should establish a formal, internal definition on Regenerative Ag using language that resonates with consumers. Rather than a separate position document, the streamlined approach would be to update GRSB's Principles & Criteria to include Regenerative Ag as an aspect of Sustainability that is outcome-based relating more specifically to soil health and environment.

Dairy Industry

There was discussion on how roundtables approach practical links with the dairy industry that work for mutual benefit without being a distraction:

- Canadian Roundtable is using Dairy in its' Life Assessment emissions profile, and also works closely with the Dairy Farmers of Canada and is looking to align its Beef Sustainability Certification Program with Dairy's Pro Action that would allow Canada to certify the dairy calves which represents 20% of beef produced in Canada.
- New Zealand Roundtable – About 60% of its' beef comes from Dairy – working to have alignment with Farm Assurance schemes for both beef and dairy for a generalized approach.
- US Roundtable has been working with the Innovation Center for US Dairy on collaboration opportunities on mutually related topics such as Greenhouse Gas Emissions, etc.

Petre added GRSB's Life Cycle Assessment Guideline is very aligned with Dairy, as both used Blonk Consultants. Also, the Dairy Sustainability Framework (DSF) is a GRSB member, and stated based on this discussion, there are opportunities for aligning approaches between Beef and Dairy, and it would be best to allow each roundtable to work individually. GRSB will be sure the work going forward is compatible with the Global Dairy Program (GDP) and the DSF.

Approaching Projects

There was discussion on how the roundtables are approaching projects and their successes/challenges.

Canada has two entry streams: (1) letters of support to academic communities that align with CRSB's priorities, (2) Projects inventory are listed on their website, specific to those helping CRSB achieve its sustainability strategy and reviewed and approved by their Scientific Community. This inventory also serves as a connection point allowing members to identify potential project collaborations. The Canadian government has also granted project funding.

US has support for projects that align with USRSB's sustainability framework. There is an application process that is reviewed and approved by a committee, and the recipients are invited to give research updates to USRSB's membership and attend their General Assembly. The roundtable will be creating a more targeted research agenda, narrowing a few focus points, and exploring how to partner with different entities and member organizations to help fund the research. The roundtable is also interested in collaborative projects to help target issues applicable cross-regions.

McConnel asked, with funding in Latin America from organizations such as: UNDP, USAID, IICA, would it be more advantageous to have more collaboration across those grants through the roundtables collectively vs. individually that may help to scale the investment and consistency?

Bruscato replied in favor of the potential collaboration for Brazil as project funding goes directly to the NGOs who organize the projects which do not get passed to the roundtable.

Beierbach stated it would be helpful to have funding and a mechanism to help producers implement measures that improve sustainability and more environmentally friendly practices beneficial to the soil, without the economical brunt associated.

Petre stated the amount of official development assistance directed to Agriculture is a small percentage of the whole and livestock is only 2% of that and doesn't compare with the amount of commercial investment that goes into livestock agriculture. Therefore, it is not sufficient in making a difference. We need to convince institutional donors that the only way to make a positive change is to invest. There is an increasing commitment level that banks and other institutions are having to make towards sustainable investments which will be helpful; some banks have sustainability deliverables attached to their investments. Any roundtable with a successful model for commercial or multinational investors, please let

GRSB know how we can assist and perhaps leverage a global approach.

ESGs (Environmental, Social, and Governance)

There was discussion on the various regional conversations and approach to ESGs. McConnel shared like many large companies in countries such as US, Canada, AU, Japan, Europe, Tyson is now legally required to report progress toward climate, biodiversity and nature impacts. Failure to disclose and/or meet their goals, could lead to potential litigation as companies are legally bound to achieve their written goals. There are current litigations with companies failing to meet their goals that are receiving market acceptance or preference for having goals. Credible data is crucial, especially data the financial markets can trust. Because beef is traded as a commodity, the easiest starting point is using industry data when buying commodities. Not all countries have data forcing data to be pulled elsewhere which may not be accurate. The call out to the roundtables is their role in helping obtain genuine data to help invest and sell the product. It will be a struggle to sell beef in certain markets if we cannot disclose impacts & progress of those markets. The window on that potential is probably 18 months - 2 years, especially, in Japan. The first place to start is obtaining data on an industry scale, then farm level where places like New Zealand and Australia have legislated carbon accounting. A prime example in Latin America is the EU Deforestation and Traceability included in their carbon disclosure laws. This is an area GRSB can help to unify and communicate some of those metrics. Measurement and disclosure will ensure beef stays on the shelf.

Ryan added the need to ensure sequestration and the carbon bank portion of cattle ranching is recognized as an offset to emissions reduction. McConnel stated a big challenge ranchers will have to face is the metrics list required to report is relatively short for GHG. Nature based disclosures and SBTi will be coming in the future.

It was widely agreed that if we don't define the numbers, somebody else will for us, and this ultimately will dictate who can or cannot not sell beef.

It was commented that from a social perspective, that beef is the only protein that can be utilized to address food security and nutrition across the globe. If we're hyper-focused on carbon, where does health, nutrition and food security come in?

Balancing Credibility & Practicality in Data Collection and Measurement

There was discussion on how to balance between practicality and credibility in data collection and measurement.

ERBS has determined not to be so subscribe in data sources, collection and methodology, but rather, focus on principles and good practices which could be interpreted at the local level in the right context. ERBS has asked their countries to: 1) make a conscience choice of data source to use, 2) have a clear rationale as to why that particular data source, and 3) transparency with any compromises with that data source.

It is important to focus on progress and credible data with a way to verify rather than perfecting data which could delay progress.

McConnel urged a key area of work for the roundtables. It would be good to have GRSB's Life Cycle Assessment (LCA) Guidance piloted in more places around the world and provide feedback on how to make it practical, and the working groups can define the credibility. Field testing helps our ability to scale it. GRSB will also have a metrics guidance for Nature and AHW.

Beierbach stated with all the good that is be done regionally, we need to report in a manner that is recognized internationally to have real value.

Driving Progress – Key Enablers & Hurdles

There was a discussion on how various roundtables are driving progress at scale, and some of their key enablers and hurdles.

Beierbach stated it is important to deal with producers at all levels with larger producers implementing the sustainable practices.

Petre asked specifically what each roundtable is doing to push greater involvement (spread of knowledge, measurement, adoption practices, etc.) in their country.

Key enablers:

- Roundtables positioning as a facilitation/connection source with a high level of trust & objectivity garners the confidence of organizations joining the beef sustainability/metrics conversation.
- Creating space for the full supply chain to come together.
- Sectors with different interests building on the coincidences – value current production work and ask the livestock sector to cooperate which helps with consensus and collaboration with other sectors.
- Roundtables serve as a place to respectfully exchange ideas and collaborate.

Key hurdles:

- Common remark: Providing producer incentives are sensible to the producer.
- Producer incentives especially, moving toward ESG reporting, metrics, GHG emissions, sequestration, storage, biodiversity, etc.
- USRSB is heavily producer focused; however, it's membership is only 72 producers out of 700K in the US. Equipping them with tools and solutions and helping them make change is a struggle.
- We need to ensure producer input in order to attain producer buy-in in order to incentivize change in the right direction.
- A communications strategy is needed for the producers in all countries to help equip them against the criticizing sectors.

Future National Roundtable (NRT) Meetings

Petre shared feedback from the last Global Conference in November that not all roundtables felt their voice is sufficiently heard. Roundtables hold four seats on the Board, and have a monthly meeting designated specifically for the interests and needs of the roundtables. Petre asked how GRSB can help these meetings be as beneficial as possible.

- Spending time giving updates limits forward progression, perhaps email updates prior to the meeting and reserve meetings for discussion on key regional topics for collaboration.
- Have less people (1-2 per roundtable, ideally, executive directors). This enables more time for each to speak and explore and process ideas together.
- Have a facilitator to help organize the discussion, use dynamic activities, etc.
- Have a topic/objective for each monthly meeting, with a work plan to achieve.
 - o Possibly take 5 minutes on each call to survey the hot topic for discussion at next meeting.
 - One topic: "LCAs – challenges and successes & how to align with SDGs (sustainable development goals)"
- Keep focus and conversation on positive aspects of sustainable livestock not livestock production.
- Have periodic rotation for goals updates from the working group leads. This would allow opportunity for roundtable questions, feedback, concerns, etc. pertaining to that goals work.
 - o Petre stated a 1:1 call with each of the roundtables with the working group leads will continue semiannually.

- Each roundtable will lead the discussion each month.
- Have the opportunity for a specific roundtable meeting at every GRSB in-person meeting (Board, Communicators Summit, etc).

Notes from this meeting will be distributed. Any action points/decisions specific to the NRT should be made at the NRT level and not require Board input or approval.

McConnel proposed one standing agenda item to be “Proposals/Actions for the Executive Committee and/or Board of Directors.” GRSB leadership looks to the roundtables for guidance on how to best support the National Roundtables, as well as be able to scale their learnings.

Monitoring, Reporting and Verification (MRV)

Petre stated GRSB is developing a global framework and agrees it would be good to have a periodic report from each of the working group leads to share on how the monitoring, reporting and verification is working in each of the goals areas.

Key upcoming beef sector events

Are there any regional events good for international awareness and engagement?

- AIM for Climate Summit, May 8-10, 2023

Next National Roundtable Meeting – April 27, 3:00 p.m. – 4:00 p.m. (US Central / Canada Time)